DEFENDANT'S

EXHIBIT 191

Castro, Kaye

From: Warner, Sarah
Sent: Tuesday, August 02, 2005 11:28 AM
To: Castro, Kaye
Subject: FW: Mr. Pavlick's DEFAMATORY E-mail

Hi Dean Castro,

I hope you're having a good summer. Mine is extremely busy - I can't believe that it is going by so quickly, and that I'll soon start my last year at Ave Maria.

Anyway, I'm sure you are plenty aware of the e-mail extravaganza that has been taking place on the Announcements List, and I also know that it is difficult to patrol the list when people are constantly pushing the bounds and breaking policies. However, over the past month, the e-mails on the list have been a bit out of control - as your e-mail regarding the Harry Potter chaos emphasized.

With no offense meant to him personally, Andrew Shirvell's constant barrage of e-mails is a blatant violation of the policy. I will grant that Charles Mailloux was just trying to start trouble when he forwarded Charles Pavlick's email to the list on Sunday. However, it was my understanding from his e-mail that he (or Mr. Pavlick for that matter) were no longer part of the Announcements List as of August 1. I am unsure why Mr. Shirvell did not just send this e-mail to the two of them personally, instead of an accusatory and threatening e-mail to the entire Ave Maria Community. Lashing out against imagined enemies, quoting bible verses condemning behavior, and threatening hypothetical lawsuits against the entire student body is *not* an announcement.

Moreover, I understand from other students that Mr. Shirvell has created his own mailing list where he can send out this type of message - I'm not sure why he has decided to start spamming the Announcements List again, when he knows the parameters of that list very well, except to harass and to gain greater attention for himself by reaching a larger audience. This past e-mail is the last in a stream of e-mails coming from Shirvell over the past two months that, while submitted under the "guise" of announcements, are really the soapboxes and self-promotions that got Mr. Shirvell completely removed from the Announcements List last year. I am all for giving people second chances, or third chances even, but I have no patience for a student who seems intent on blatantly ignoring and breaking school policy merely to forward his own agenda. I know several other students have voiced these views as well.

I'm not sure what kind of action should be taken with regard to Mr. Shirvell, or frankly anyone else who abuses policies to this extent, but I know that I would be very thankful if I did not receive his e-mails any longer. I generally enjoy the Announcements List and think it is a great opportunity to share events, articles, etc., that might be of interest to the student body. It is really too bad that a few students seem intent on its abuse.

Thanks for lending an ear to my frustrations (again). I will hopefully hear from you soon.

Amicalement, Sarah

From: Shirvell, Andrew
Sent: Mon 8/1/2005 11:17 PM
To: Mailloux, Charles; *Announcements*; Pavlick, Charles
Subject: Mr. Pavlick's DEFAMATORY E-mail

August 1, 2005

Dear Ave Maria Community:

I want to be EXPLICITLY clear that the May 12, 2005 e-mail recently forwarded to this

public announcements list - yet again - was **NOT** written by me. Mr. Pavlick took it upon himself to usurp my identity and type up a malicious e-mail deriding all of us - the faculty, staff, administration, and student body (including myself) - by purposefully using my name.

This cowardly act has been repeated by Mr. Pavlick numerous times over the past few years, involving other students' identities as well. I do NOT view this as a "simple parody" as some in the administration allegedly do. I view Mr. Pavlick's e-mail as defamatory, with the sole aim of assassinating my character.

I know that some of my outspoken positions open me up to unjust attacks - but this latest episode goes well beyond even that limit. Mr. Mailloux, my on-again, off-again "friend," knows very well how I feel about Mr. Pavlick's May 12th e-mail, and yet he sent his message anyway. This seems part of a larger pattern over the past few weeks, which includes harassing, threatening, and sometimes anonymous e-mails from individual students as well as vicious attacks on me personally via the public announcements list. All of the above seems to me well-coordinated and purposefully designed to provoke me.

I see through the campaign of lies and deception being waged against me by a few disgruntled, envious, and/or mixed-up members of our community.

I will only say this once: If any of these persons continue to circulate Mr. Pavlick's e-mail in any manner, I will not hesitate to bring suit against any and all perpetrators.

I hope that I have finally put this nonsense to rest.

"Blessed are those who are persecuted for righteousness sake, for theirs is the kingdom of heaven. Blessed are you when they revile and persecute you, and say all kinds of evil against you falsely for my sake. Rejoice and be exceedingly glad, for great is your reward in heaven, for so they persecuted the prophets who were before you." [MT 5: 10-12]

Peacefully yours,

Andrew L. Shirvell

"Never Underestimate the Motivation of a True Believer."

From: Mailloux, Charles
Sent: Sun 7/31/2005 9:28 PM
To: *Announcements*; Pavlick, Charles
Subject: Charles pavlick is my hero

In honor of my last day with an e-mail account...

I want to let the school community know, that this, by far, was the funniest e-mail i recieved at ave.

peace out

-C Daddy

-----Original Message-----
From: Pavlick, Charles
Sent: Thursday, May 12, 2005 12:21 PM
To: *Announcements*
Subject: FW: Request!

All right, Andrew, I'll forward it, but only because you're so cute!!!

-----Original Message-----
From: Shirvell, Andrew
Sent: Thursday, May 12, 2005 1:37 AM
To: Shirvell, Andrew
Subject: Request!

Dear All:

I want to take this opportunity to abuse the e-mail policy of this school one more time before school ends. I think the e-mail policy is ridiculous, but what could you expect from the bozos who comprise our faculty, staff, and administration. Not that the student body is any better. All you guys do is drink and smoke while I'm out saving babies. I expected a lot better from a school named after our Blessed Mother. I expected the students to be better people, more like me. You guys have totally let me and God down.

I have to run. I have to get to chapel before Mass starts. I want to leave some flyers with my name on them in the back of the chapel, and I have to get in and out before I hear any Latin. By the way, there's a talk at St. Mary's student parish next Wednesday on how it's a sin to have more money than me. If you rich kids would spend less on your fancy cars and more on sponsoring my programs, think of all the babies I could save. And flyers with my name on them I could print up.

Also could someone send this on to announcements for me? I may be back on that list soon - pending Opus Dei approval of course (just kidding - well sort of!).

Andrew L. Shirvell: 734-476-3916
"Never Underestimate the Serious Emotional Problems of a True Believer"